

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT
COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT OF
FLORIDA TAMPA DIVISION**

Case No: 8:04-md-2523-T-30TBM

IN RE: MDL: 1626

ACCUTANE PRODUCTS LIABILITY

ORDER

THIS CAUSE is before the Court on Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories

Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation (Dkt. 723), Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to same (Dkt. 724), Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to Supplement and to Submit Newly Discovered Evidence in Opposition to Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation and Request to Defer Ruling (Dkt. 727), and Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Response in Opposition to same (Dkt. 728).

The Court, having reviewed the motions, responses, and being otherwise advised in

the premises, concludes that Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to Supplement and to Submit Newly Discovered Evidence in Opposition to Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation and Request to Defer Ruling (Dkt. 727) should be denied and Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation (Dkt. 723) should be granted.

[Case 8:04-md-02523-JSM-TBM Document 729 Filed 10/28/2009 Page 2 of 3](#)

The Court previously granted Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion to exclude the general causation testimony of Dr. Ronald Fogel, the Plaintiffs' only designated expert on the issue of general causation (Dkt. 721). Further, the Court denies Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to Supplement and to Submit Newly Discovered Evidence in Opposition to Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation and Request to Defer Ruling. Without expert testimony that Accutane can cause IBD, Plaintiffs are unable to prove liability in all cases in which Dr. Fogel has been designated as the expert on this issue. Those cases are as follows:

1. Eileen Baril 8:04-cv-2768-T-30TBM
2. Kenneth Palmer 8:04-cv-2769-T-30TBM

3. Christopher M. Perronne 8:04-cv-2766-T-30TBM

4. Clay R. Seymour 8:06-cv-1989-T-30TBM

5. Jason S. Adkins 8:06-cv-2296-T-30TBM

Accordingly, it is ORDERED and ADJUDGED that:

1. Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to Supplement and to Submit Newly Discovered

Evidence in Opposition to Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories

Inc.'s Motion for Summary Judgment on Causation and Request to Defer

Ruling (Dkt. 727) is hereby **DENIED**.

2. Hoffmann-LaRoche Inc. and Roche Laboratories Inc.'s Motion for Summary

Judgment on Causation (Dkt. 723) is hereby **GRANTED**.

Page 2 of 3

3. The Clerk is directed to close the above-referenced cases and terminate any

pending motions in those cases.

DONE and **ORDERED** in Tampa, Florida on October 28, 2009.

Copies furnished to:

Counsel/Parties of

Record

S:\MDL-Accutane\MSJ\Dkt723.frm

Case 8:04-md-02523-JSM-TBM Document 729 Filed 10/28/2009 Page 3 of 3

